



Methodology Checklist 2: Controlled Trials

Study identification (Include author, title, year of publication, journal title, pages)

Guideline topic:

Key Question No:

Reviewer:

Before completing this checklist, consider:

1. Is the paper a **randomised controlled trial** or a **controlled clinical trial**? If in doubt, check the study design algorithm available from SIGN and make sure you have the correct checklist. If it is a **controlled clinical trial** questions 1.2, 1.3, and 1.4 are not relevant, and the study cannot be rated higher than 1+
2. Is the paper relevant to key question? Analyse using PICO (Patient or Population Intervention Comparison Outcome). IF NO REJECT (give reason below). IF YES complete the checklist.

Reason for rejection: 1. Paper not relevant to key question 2. Other reason (please specify):

SECTION 1: INTERNAL VALIDITY

| <i>In a well conducted RCT study...</i> | | <i>Does this study do it?</i> |
|---|---|--|
| 1.1 | The study addresses an appropriate and clearly focused question. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.2 | The assignment of subjects to treatment groups is randomised. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.3 | An adequate concealment method is used. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.4 | The design keeps subjects and investigators 'blind' about treatment allocation. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.5 | The treatment and control groups are similar at the start of the trial. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.6 | The only difference between groups is the treatment under investigation. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.7 | All relevant outcomes are measured in a standard, valid and reliable way. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.8 | What percentage of the individuals or clusters recruited into each treatment arm of the study dropped out before the study was completed? | |
| 1.9 | All the subjects are analysed in the groups to which they were randomly allocated (often referred to as intention to treat analysis). | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> Does not apply <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.10 | Where the study is carried out at more than one site, results are comparable for all sites. | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Can't say <input type="checkbox"/> Does not apply <input type="checkbox"/> |

SECTION 2: OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF THE STUDY

| | | |
|-----|---|---|
| 2.1 | How well was the study done to minimise bias? <i>Code as follows:</i> | High quality (++) <input type="checkbox"/> Acceptable (+) <input type="checkbox"/> Low quality (-) <input type="checkbox"/> Unacceptable – reject 0 <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.2 | Taking into account clinical considerations, your evaluation of the methodology used, and the statistical power of the study, are you certain that the overall effect is due to the study intervention? | |
| 2.3 | Are the results of this study directly applicable to the patient group targeted by this guideline? | |
| 2.4 | Notes. Summarise the authors' conclusions. Add any comments on your own assessment of the study, and the extent to which it answers your question and mention any areas of uncertainty raised above. | |
| | | |