iCAHE JC Critical Appraisal Summary

Journal Club Details

Journal Club: Hampstead Rehabilitation Centre
JC Facilitator: Danielle Gyss
JC Discipline: Occupational Therapy

Clinical Scenario

What is the reliability and validity of the Montreal Cognitive Assessment (MoCA) for people with cognitive decline?

Review Question/PICO/PECO

P people with cognitive decline
E MoCA
C other assessment tests
O reliability and validity

Article/Paper


Please note: due to copyright regulations CAHE is unable to supply a copy of the critically appraised paper/article. If you are an employee of the South Australian government you can obtain a copy of articles from the DOHSA librarian.

Article Methodology: Observational study

Returned JC on: 2011

By iCAHE staff member: Dr. Suchi Garg
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ques No.</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Can’t Tell</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1        |     |            |    | *Is this test relevant to practice?*  
Journal club to answer |
| 2        |     |            |    | *Was there a review of literature?*  
The authors have sourced very relevant literature to justify the need for their study. They provided evidence for the use of MMSE as a reference standard, and have described previous researches which examined the sensitivity of MoCA in identifying individuals with cognitive problems. While there is evidence for MoCA’s sensitivity in a range of clinical populations, there have been no published studies on its use in a geriatric rehabilitation sample. Hence, the need for the current study. |
| 3        |     |            |    | *Was the objective of the questionnaire clear?*  
The objective of the study was to determine the applicability of the MoCA to a geriatric rehabilitation sample and to look at its ability to predict rehabilitation outcomes. |
| 4        |     |            |    | *What variables/indicators were measured? Were they consistent with the objective of the questionnaire?*  
The variables measured in the study are cognitive (MMSE, MoCA, FIM), emotional (CIRS, GDS) and medical (CIRS, GDS) status; functional and rehabilitation outcomes (FIM). |
| 5        |     |            |    | *Are the results of this study valid?*  
- Was there an independent comparison with a reference (gold) standard of diagnosis?  
Yes, the results of Montreal Cognitive Assessment (MoCA) were compared with Mini-Mental Status Examination which was considered to be the best-known measure of cognition and one that has been commonly used in geriatric assessment.  
- Was the test evaluated in an appropriate spectrum of subjects (like those to whom it would be offered in practice)?  
The participants were from a geriatric rehabilitation inpatient service which provides an interdisciplinary treatment approach to optimize independent function in frail old patients. The majority of the cases (62%) were of orthopedic injuries and the rest comprised of neurological (19%), medically complex diseases (11%) and cardiac disorders (4%). |
| 6        |     |            |    | *What were the results?*  
The study found significant correlations between MoCA and the other cognitive measures (MMSE and FIM cognitive scores). The study also concluded that MoCA has a considerable advantage over MMSE in sensitivity and equivalence in specificity using both total and attention scale scores. Additionally, MoCA is found to be a more useful tool in detecting cognitive impairment and predicting rehabilitation outcome in the given population. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th><strong>Were the methods for performing the test described in sufficient detail to permit replication?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>The authors have provided information about the timing of administering the tests (Pg. 1584). A comprehensive assessment of each patient’s functional status was done using Functional Independence Measure (FIM). MMSE was administered soon after admission and after completion of the rehabilitation program. Patient’s functional and mental reassessment was done few days after discharge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Will the test be available, affordable, accurate and reliable in my setting?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Journal club to answer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>