



iCAHE JC Critical Appraisal Summary

Journal Club Details

Article/Paper

O'Connor, A, Cahill, M & McKay, EA, 2012, 'Revisiting 1:1 and 2:1 clinical placement models: Student and clinical educator perspectives', *Australian Occupational Therapy Journal*, vol. 59, pp. 276-283.

Article Methodology: Qualitative

Click [here](#) to access critical appraisal tool

Ques No.	Yes	Can't Tell	No	Comments
1	✓			<p>Was there a clear statement of the aims of the research?</p> <p>This research study proposed to:</p> <p>(a) Compare the experiences and perspectives of both clinical educators and students involved in the 1:1 and 2:1 models of clinical education across occupational therapy and physiotherapy programs.</p> <p>(b) Explore the learning opportunities available to students on 1:1 and 2:1 models of clinical education from students' and clinical educators' perspectives.</p> <p>(c) Determine from students' and clinical educators' perspectives what further planning and support, if any, is required to facilitate these models by the new University-based clinical education teams.</p>
2	✓			<p>Is a qualitative methodology appropriate?</p> <p>A qualitative methodology was appropriate as the objectives of the study were to explore <i>perspectives</i> and <i>experiences</i> of students and educators.</p> <p>Is it worth continuing? YES</p>
3	✓			<p>Was the research design appropriate to address the aims of the research?</p> <p>A qualitative descriptive approach was used to address the study objectives. Descriptive research aims to provide a rich descriptive account of the issue being studied within a particular context.</p>
4	✓			<p>Was the recruitment strategy appropriate to address the aims of the research?</p> <p>Participants were recruited to the study using a convenience sampling strategy. Convenience sampling is one of the most commonly used, yet one of the least appropriate sampling strategies as participants are primarily selected on the basis of ease of access to the researcher and, secondarily, for their knowledge of the subject matter.</p> <p>Most qualitative studies use purposeful (or purposive) sampling, a conscious selection of a small number of data sources that meet particular criteria (Russell 2003)</p>

CONTACTS

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe
 iCAHE@unisa.edu.au
 Telephone: +61 8 830 22099
 Fax: +61 8 830 22853

University of South Australia
 GPO Box 2471
 Adelaide SA 5001
 Australia

CRICOS Provider Number
 00121B



University of
 South Australia

International Centre for
 Allied Health Evidence
 iCAHE

A member of the Sansom Institute

				Russell, CK & Gregory, DM, 2003, 'Evaluation of qualitative research studies', <i>Evid Based Nurs</i> , vol. 6, pp. 36-40.
5	✓			<p>Were the data collected in a way that addressed the research issue?</p> <p>A semi-structured individual interview format was used; this technique enables questions to be asked of all participants while facilitating open responses. The interview guide was developed by the researchers following a review of the literature and pilot testing of the literature. The interview questions are provided on P278.</p>
6	✓			<p>Has the relationship between researcher and participants been adequately considered?</p> <p>It was reported that the researcher conducting the student interviews had no connection with their professional programme.</p>
7	✓			<p>Have ethical issues been taken into consideration?</p> <p>Ethical approval was received from the University of Limerick Research Ethics Committee. Written informed consent was obtained from all participants.</p>
8	✓			<p>Was the data analysis sufficiently rigorous?</p> <p>Thematic analysis was used to analyze the results. To ensure the data analysis was rigorous the following strategies were put in place:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Member checking - Participant details anonymised - Interviews were independently coded by two researchers (researchers then met and agreed on general codes). A third researcher then reviewed random segments of interviews to ensure coding was accurate. - Detailed documentation was kept from throughout the research process. - Field notes were taken from interview
9	✓			<p>Is there a clear statement of findings?</p> <p>Three distinct themes were identified which influenced the learning experience of students and clinical educators involved in each model of clinical education.</p> <p>These themes were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learning opportunities and experiences • Organisation and work planning • Relationships <p>These are then discussed in detail in the findings section.</p>
10				<p>How valuable is the research?</p> <p>Journal Club to discuss.</p>